


## आवश्यक सूचना

पत्रांक - 3891  
दिनांक - 26-12-24

बिहार राज्य मध्याह्न भोजन योजना समिति, बिहार, पटना के अंतर्गत राज्य स्तरीय कार्यालय, जिला स्तरीय कार्यालय एवं मध्याह्न भोजन योजना से आच्छादित विद्यालयों का वित्तीय वर्ष 2021-22 से 2023-24 तक आंतरिक अंकेक्षण (Internal Audit) हेतु कोटेशन संख्या 2802 दिनांक 12.09.2024 निर्गत किया गया था। उक्त कोटेशन के आलोक में प्राप्त कुल 88 सनदी लेखाकार से तकनीकी निविदा प्राप्त हुआ है। सभी तकनीकी निविदा का मूल्यांकन कर विभागीय साईट [www.mdmsbihar.org](http://www.mdmsbihar.org) पर अपलोड कर दिया गया है। सभी सनदी लेखाकार को दिये गये स्कोर/अंक कम या अधिक प्रदर्शित होता है, तो एक सप्ताह के अन्दर (31.12.2024 तक) अधोहस्ताक्षरी कार्यालय में आपत्ती दर्ज कर सकते हैं। उक्त तिथि के बाद प्राप्त आपत्ती पर कोई विचार नहीं किया जाएगा। उक्त के संदर्भ में बिहार राज्य मध्याह्न भोजन योजना समिति निर्णय लेने हेतु स्वतंत्रत होगा।

  
(विनायक मिश्र)

निदेशक

मध्याह्न भोजन योजना,  
बिहार, पटना।

Mid day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA Firm & Address	Empanelled with CAAG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Completed at least 2 but less than 4 internal audit / Statutory Audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization preceding 21-22 in between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 internal audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and articles assistant / Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept		
1	Full Marks	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	28	29
2	Burns & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
3	Todd Tidyam & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
4	R.M. Mishra & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
5	R.M. Sinha & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
6	A.K. Sainpuria & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
7	Vijaya Singh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
8	M.A. Baid & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
9	P.K. Singh & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
10	K.K. Chatterji & Assoc.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
11	Laxmi Tripathi & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
12	Vinay Nandan & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
13	Sri Prakash & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
14	Mishra & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
15	Single Day Mishra & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
16	M.A. & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
17	Roy Ghosh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
18	U.S. Prasad & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
19	MATSS & Company	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
20	Sudhi Kumar Sharma & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
21	V. Rohngal & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
22	M. Bora & Co. First Floor	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
23	Shanmugam & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
24	Konandoor & CO LLP	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
25	Anguli Jain & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
26	M/S Gupta Sachdeva & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
27	M/S Dhruv K. Yadav & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
28	P. Jyoti & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
29	ANANT DOKAINA & CO.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
30	M/S Dasaari & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
31	M/S Singh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
32	M/S ATN & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100
33	M/S M & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100	100

D:\Vishayak Shikshak Fodder\Technical Bid evaluation 2nd Phase\Technical Final Evaluation Self.xls  
 1. FCC not attached from Last five Years.  
 2. CA Inter certificate attached only 5.  
 1. FCC Not attached for last five Years.  
 2. Self Declaration not attached.  
 1. Age less than 30 years.  
 1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Branch office in Bihar.  
 1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Branch office in Bihar.  
 1. FCC not attached last five Years PAPA NO-18  
 1. FCC not attached from Last five Years.  
 2. CA Inter certificate attached only 5.

Mild day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empired with C&AG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years ending with 31.3.23 (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet	Completed at least 2 but less than 4 internal audit / Statutory Audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in processing between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 internal audit / Statutory Audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in processing between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be Considered.	Completed 8 or more internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in processing between 21-22 to 23-24.	Maximum 15 Point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and articles assistant/ Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept	
1															
2															
33	Prudera Agrawal & Associates	10	10	15	25	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	10	90	1. FCC Not Attached from Last five Years.
34	S Jayshankar	10	10	15	25	10	10	15	15	10	5	5	10	90	1. FCC Not Attached for last five Years. 2. Latest Biddinging notice not Provided dated 08.03.2024 Bids/ tender date. Peer reviewd certificate Dtd/04/11.
35	R.M. Associates	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	90	1. Peer Review Certificate attached only period of 1.4.12 to 31.03.15. Bid wanted to last two Years.
36	G.K. Sarda & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	90	1. Peer Review Certificate not attached.
37	Rohini Rajesh Kumar & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	90	1. Age of firm less than 30 Years
38	Kumar Kishor & Chandra	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	90	1. Age of firm less than 30 Years
39	RBS & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	90	1. Age less than 30 Years
40	R. Shukla & Company	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	89	1. FCC Not attached for last five year. 2. Member Card not attached for article clerk.
41	Munqam & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	89	1. Branch office not continue in Operation from last five Years. 2. Member Card not attached for articles clerk.
42	A.K. Mishra & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	88	1. Peer Review Certificate not attached. 2. Less than 5 FCA
43	Mamteshwar Singh & Company	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	88	1. FCC Not attached for last five year. 2. Member Card not attached for article details.
44	Thakur Vaidyanath Aiyar & Co.	10	10	5	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	88	1. FCC Not attached for 5 Years.
45	Rohitg Ashish & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	87.5	1. Less than 5 FCA.
46	Jatindar Brijesh & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	87	1. Age Less than 30 Years. 2. CA/ Itr only 8 and No member card attached.
47	S R S & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	87	1. Less than 5 FCA (FCA-2+4 Marks, and ACA 2+1 5+3 MARKS)
48	Sandeep Gupta & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	86	1. FCC Not attached for last five years
49	Apurva Mahesh K & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Branch office in Bihar. 2. Only five assignment attached for the period attached 1-22 to 2023-24.
50	PSD & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. peer review certificate not attached.
51	Perik & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. Age of firm less than 30 Years
52	M/S Sankhwal & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. Age of firm less than 30 Years.
53	K.A.P.S. & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. No any CA Itr Certificate attached only articles details has submitted. 2. FCC Not attached.
54	N.K.D. & Co.	10	10	5	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	85	1. No any CA Itr Certificate attached only articles details has submitted. 2. FCC Not attached.
55	M/S PC Chhajal & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	3	3	10	84.5	1. No any CA Itr Certificate attached only articles details has submitted. 2. FCC Not attached.

Approved

Dr

ME

Das

nm

Mid day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Employed with CAG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Past experience in similar assignment Internal audit / Statutory Audit (5)	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and assistant / Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		28
2		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		29
3		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		30
4		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		31
5		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		32
6		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		33
7		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		34
8		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		35
9		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		36
10		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		37
11		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		38
12		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		39
13		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		40
14		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		41
15		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		42
16		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		43
17		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		44
18		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		45
19		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		46
20		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		47
21		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		48
22		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		49
23		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		50
24		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		51
25		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		52
26		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		53
27		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		54
28		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		55
29		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		56
30		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		57
31		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		58
32		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		59
33		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		60
34		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		61
35		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		62
36		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		63
37		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		64
38		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		65
39		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		66
40		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		67
41		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		68
42		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		69
43		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		70
44		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		71
45		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		72
46		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		73
47		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		74
48		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		75
49		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		76
50		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		77
51		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		78
52		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		79
53		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		80
54		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		81
55		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		82
56		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		83
57		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		84
58		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		85
59		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		86
60		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		87
61		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		88
62		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		89
63		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		90
64		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		91
65		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		92
66		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		93
67		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		94
68		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		95
69		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		96
70		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		97
71		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		98
72		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		99
73		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		100

D:\Vishayak Sir\Excel Folder\Technical Bid evaluation 2nd Phase\Technical Final Evaluation Serf. 36

Approved For me By

Mid day Meal Scheme

Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empanelled with C&AG and RBI (1)	Maximum Cumulative Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover - three years (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Pract experience in Similar assignment i.e Internal audit/ Statutory/ Audit (5)	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant/ Audit staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1										
2	M/S G.Mittal & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	26	10	78.5	1. C&AG 2023-24 Not Attached. So Disqualify 2. Average turnover less than 40 Lakh. 3. Peer review certificate not attached.
3										
4										
5										
6										
7										
8										
9										
10										
11										
12										
13										
14										
15										
16										
17										
18										
19										
20										
21										
22										
23										
24										
25										
26										
27										
28										
29										
30										
31										
32										
33										
34										
35										
36										
37										
38										
39										
40										
41										
42										
43										
44										
45										
46										
47										
48										
49										
50										
51										
52										
53										
54										
55										
56										
57										
58										
59										
60										
61										
62										
63										
64										
65										
66										
67										
68										
69										
70										
71										
72										
73										
74										
75										
76										
77										
78										
79										
80										
81										
82										
83										
84										
85										

Handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink on the left margin.

D:\Vishayak Shrivastava\Folder\Technical Bid evaluation 2nd Phase\Technical Final Evaluation Self\_26

Mid day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empowered with C&AG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Past experience in similar assignment i.e. Internal audit/ Statutory Audit (5)	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit/ Statutory Audit / Statutory assignment of Govt./ PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant/ Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1	MAPSS & Company Jaran Chapra Muzaffarpur Bihar-842001	10	More than 10 years up to 15 years	10	Firm has head office in Bihar	Completed at least 2 but more than 4 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn 10 point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6) FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point Employe of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point C.A. maximum 3 point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Not evaluated due to letter given by CA Firm H.O	28 Not evaluated.
2	MAPSS & Company Jaran Chapra Muzaffarpur Bihar-842001	0	More than 10 years up to 15 years	25	Firm has head office in Bihar	Completed at least 2 but more than 4 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn 10 point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6) FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point Employe of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point C.A. maximum 3 point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Not evaluated due to letter given by CA Firm H.O	29 Not evaluated.
3	MAPSS & Company Jaran Chapra Muzaffarpur Bihar-842001	0	More than 10 years up to 15 years	25	Firm has head office in Bihar	Completed at least 2 but more than 4 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn 10 point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6) FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point Employe of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point C.A. maximum 3 point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Not evaluated due to letter given by CA Firm H.O	29 Not evaluated.
4	MAPSS & Company Jaran Chapra Muzaffarpur Bihar-842001	0	More than 10 years up to 15 years	25	Firm has head office in Bihar	Completed at least 2 but more than 4 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn 10 point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6) FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point Employe of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point C.A. maximum 3 point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Not evaluated due to letter given by CA Firm H.O	29 Not evaluated.
5	S.M. Kojur & Associates	10	More than 10 years up to 15 years	15	Firm has head office in Bihar	Completed at least 2 but more than 4 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory / Audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of Govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be considered.	Maximum Turn 10 point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6) FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point Employe of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point C.A. maximum 3 point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Not evaluated due to letter given by CA Firm H.O	29 Not evaluated.

*Prasanna*  
24/12/24

(Pragati)  
Nutrition Expert  
MDM, Bihar Patna

*Prasanna*  
24/12/24

(Md. Muztaba)  
A.P.C.  
MDM, Bihar Patna

*Prasanna*  
24/12/24

(Saroj Kumar)  
Accounts Officer  
MDM, Bihar Patna

*Prasanna*  
24/12/24

(Dignity Kumar)  
Data Officer cum System Adm.  
MDM, Bihar Patna

*Prasanna*  
22.12.24

(Baleshwar P. Yadav)  
I/c Deputy Director  
MDM, Bihar Patna

Mid day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empanelled with CAG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory Audit (5)	Completed at least 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. (6)	Completed 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be Considered. (7)	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (8)	Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant / Audit Staff (7)	Maximum Point	Total Point	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1	Full Marks	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		29
2	Burn & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
3	Todd Tulagan & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
4	R.N Mishra & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
5	R.N. Shrivastava & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
6	A.K. Selampuria & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
7	Vijaya Singh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
8	N.R. Baird & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
9	P.K. Singhani & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
10	K.K. Chandra & Assoc.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
11	Laxmi Trifid & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
12	Vinay Neveon & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
13	Sri Prakash & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
14	Wohindra & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
15	Singh Ray Mishra & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
16	K.R.A. & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
17	Ray Ghosh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
18	U.S. Prasad & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
19	MALSS & Company	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
20	Sushil Kumar Sharma & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
21	V. Rohit & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
22	M. Bora & Co. First Floor	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
23	Shri Ram & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
24	Kemandoor & CO LLP	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
25	Angaji Jain & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	100		
26	M/S Gupta Sachdeva & Co.	10	0	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. Peer review Certificate not attached.	
27	M/S Dhruv K. Verma & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. Age Less than 30 Years. 2. Self declaration not attached.	
28	P. J. Patel & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. Age less than 30 years.	
29	AAJAY DOOLAYA & CO.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Brand office in Bihar.	
30	M/S Dhanraj & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Brand office in Bihar.	
31	M/S S Singh & Associates	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. FCC not attached last five Years 2. Self Declaration not attached. RFP PARA NO-18	
32	M/S ATN & Co.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	90	1. FCC not attached from Last five Years. 2. CA Inter certificate attached only 8.	

D:\Vijayak Shikshak Fodder\Technical Bid evaluation 2nd Phase\Technical Final Evaluation Set 26

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empanelled with C&AG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Past experience in Similar assignment Le Internal audit Statutory Audit (5)	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 Internal audit / Statutory Audit / assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 8 or more Internal/Statutory audit/assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be Considered.	Maximum m Point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant / Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1													
2													
33	Prudex Agrawal & Associates	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	15	10	10	10	10
34	S Jaysham	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	15	10	10	10	10
35	R.M. Associates	10	0	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
36	G.K. Sunka & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
37	Sharan Rajesh Kumar & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
38	Kumar Kishor & Chandra	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
39	KBOS & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
40	R.Shukla & Company	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
41	Nrupam & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
42	A.K. Mishra & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
43	Manmohan Singh & Company	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
44	Thakur, Vaidyanath Aiyer & Co.	10	10	5	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
45	Rohit Ashish & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
46	Intional English & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
47	S R S & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
48	Satendra Gupta & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
49	Aparna Mahesh K & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
50	PSD & Associates	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
51	Pank & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
52	M/S Sankhade & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
53	K.R.P.S & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
54	N.K.R. & Co.	10	10	5	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10
55	M/S PC Chhajlani & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	10

Done

MR

DS

gn

1. FCC Not attached for last five years.  
2. Only five assignment attached for the period attached 2021-22 to 2023-24.

1. FCC Not attached for last five years.  
2. Member Card not attached for article details.

1. FCC Not attached for last five years.  
2. Member Card not attached for article details.



Sl. No.	Name of CA Firm & Address	Empanelled with C&AG and RBI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover (ending with 31.3.23) (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Past experience in similar assignment to Internal audit / Statutory Audit (5)	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 internal audit / Statutory Audit	Completed at least 8 or more internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be Considered.	Maxim um Point	Full time partner / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of sent qualified staff and article assistants / Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept		
1															
56	Mansel Maheshwari & Co.	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	15	10	10	5	5	84	1. Age less than 30 Years 2. Member Card for Article details not attached (Prove of document as a article three not attached)
57	Sanjay Shankar Umlia & Co.	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	15	10	10	5	5	84	1. Age less than 30 Years 2. FCA Less than five 3. Turn over less than 50 Lakh.
58	Rajesh Krishna Khanna & Associates	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	15	10	10	5	5	83.5	1. FCC Not attached for last five years 2. Only 3 CA Inter has been attached.
59	M.K. Singh & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	16	10	15	10	10	5	8	83	1. Past Review Certificate not attached. 2. Turnover less than 50 Lakh. 3. Member Card not attached for article details. For para no-7 Memory affidavit not attached for black listing with tender documents.
60	C K Prusty & Associates	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	15	10	10	5	3	83	1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Branch office in Bihar. 2. CA Inter certificate not attached with tender document.
61	P K Chopra & Co.	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	5	7	82	1. No Inter. No C&AG 2023-24 / No five Years 2. FCC Not attached for 5 Years.
62	N.K. Singh & Associates	10	10	15	25	28	10	15	10	10	10	5	10	80	1. FCC Not attached for branch office in Bihar from last five Years. 2. Establishment date of Bihar branch 01.08.2020 3. Assignment less than eight for the FY-21-22 TO 23-24
63	Habbullah & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	10	5	10	80	1. Past Review certificate not attached so no marks in point No one. 2. FCC HAS NOT BEEN ATTACHED FROM LAST FIVE YEARS (Prove of document for Branch office in Bihar)
64	PCS & Associates	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	15	10	10	5	10	80	1. Less than 30 Years old 2. FCC HAS NOT BEEN ATTACHED FROM LAST FIVE YEARS (Prove of document for Branch office in Bihar)
65	K.Hari & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	10	5	10	80	1. Past Review certificate not attached for point no-1
66	Goyal Parul & Co.	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	15	10	10	5	10	80	1. FCC Not attached last five Years for Branch office in Bihar. 2. Age less than 30 Years.
67	M/S K.R.D.S. & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	10	5	5	80	1. Past Review Certificate Not attached. 2. Less than 8 Assignment 3. CA Inter-2 Articles-6
68	Bijay Vihari & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	10	15	15	10	10	5	5	80	1. Age of firm less than 30 Years 2. Past Review Certificate not attached.
69	Thakur Shivvanshi & Associates	10	10	5	15	25	10	15	15	10	10	5	10	80	1. FCC Not attached for 5 Years.

Answer Rm ml Day

am

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empanelled with C&AG and RRI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years ending with 31.23 (3)					Head office and branch office (4)				Past experience in Similar assignment & Internal audit Statutory Audit (5)					Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)					Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant / Audit Staff (7)		Remarks	Reject/ Accept						
		Maximum m Point	More than 10 years up to 15 years	More than 15 years up to 30 years	More than 30 years up to 40 years	More than 40 years up to 50 years	More than 50 years	From 30 lakhs upto 40 lakhs	From 40 lakhs upto 50 lakhs	More than 50 lakhs	Maximum m Point	Firm has head office in Bihar	Firm has branch office in Bihar	Maximum m Point	Completed at least 2 but less than 4 internal audit / Statutory Audit	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 internal audit / Statutory Audit	Completed 8 or more internal/Statutory audit assignment of govt./PSU/ organization in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 24 Bank Audit assignment in preceding between 21-22 to 23-24.	Maximum m Point	Full time FCA partner 2 point each maximum 10 point	Full time ACA partner 1.5 point each maximum 5 point	CA Employee of firm 1 point each employee maximum 3 point	Maximum m Point	For semi qualified staff 1 point each maximum 10 point	For article assistant/ audit Staff 0.5 point each maximum 5 point	Maximum Point	Total Point					
1		3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29				
70	M/s. Ashish & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	25	10	15	20	10	5	10	5	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	9.5	10	5	10	10	79.5	1	10	1	Diagonally 2. Average turnover less than 40 Lakh. 3. Peer review certificate not attached.	
71	Ghoshal & Ghoshal	10	0	10	15	25	25	10	15	20	10	5	10	5	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	79	1	9	1	1. MEF Certificate Not Attached. 2. FCC not Attached for last 5 years. So Marks will be zero. 3. Member Card for article details not attached.		
72	Nandy/Holder & Ganguli	10	0	10	15	25	25	10	15	20	10	5	10	5	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	78	1	8	1	1. CAG 2023-24 Not Attached 2. FCC Not attached for 5 Years. 3. CA INTER-8.		
73	Prasad Kumar & Company	10	10	5	15	25	16	10	15	20	20	10	5	8	10	15	15	10	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	78	1	8	1	1. Less than 30 Years. 2. Already Calculated.		
74	Shankar Ranjoo Pradyum & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	16	10	15	20	20	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	77	1	7	1	1. Applied for Peer Review / Not able for peer review. 2. Less than 30 years old. 3. Member Card not attached for Article Details.		
75	M/s. Mishra Sarayendra & Co.	10	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	20	10	5	10	5	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	7	10	5	10	77	1	10	1	1. Less than 30 Years. 2. Already Calculated.		
76	Rak Chandra & Co. LLP	10	10	10	15	25	16	10	15	20	20	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	75	1	10	1	1. FCC HAS NOT BEEN ATTACHED FROM LAST FIVE YEARS. (Proof of document for Branch office in Bihar) 2. Less than eight assignment.		
77	D. Das & Associates	10	10	5	15	25	16	10	15	20	18	10	5	10	15	15	15	15	10	5	3	9.5	10	5	10	74.5	1	10	1	Age-28 Year, Less than 50 Lakh, 5 years FCC Not Attached, Less than 5 FCA		
78	Suman Jyoti & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	16	10	15	20	20	10	5	10	15	15	15	15	10	5	3	10	10	5	10	70	1	10	1	1. Age Less than 30 Years. 2. Peer review certificate not attached. So 0 Marks in point No-01		
79	Sanjay Kumar Das &	10	0	5	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	2	0	0	0	0	0	1. No spiral binding 2. Peer review certificate not attached and No Page no. No evaluate. 3. turnover less than 40 lakhs	Not evaluated.	
80	KABHUJ & Company	10	0	5	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	1. Not evaluated because no spiral binding According to para no. 6 (vi) of Tender Document. 2. Age of firm -17 Years- CA Inter certificate not Attached	Not evaluated.
81	M/S Kumar Sanjay & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	1. No spiral binding No Indexing, So that No Evaluation. 2. Peer review certificate not attached and No Page no. No evaluate. 3. turnover less than 40 lakhs	Not evaluated.
82	NDSCA & Associates	10	0	5	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	1. No spiral binding No Indexing, So that No Evaluation. 2. Peer review certificate not attached and No Page no. No evaluate. 3. turnover less than 40 lakhs	Not evaluated.
83	Mahant Singh & Associates	10	0	10	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	1. Not evaluated because no spiral binding According to para no. 6 (vi) of Tender Document. 1. Not evaluated because No spiral binding According to para no. 6 (vi) of Tender Document.	Not evaluated.
84	M/S Vinod Singh & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	Not Evaluated due to case citation (2023) BIC LAW IN 42 NIPA OROPER NO 290203 DATED 21.08.2023 CA MANJEET KUMAR VERMA	Not evaluated.
85	K. Pandey & Co.	10	0	10	15	25	0	10	15	20	0	10	5	10	10	15	15	15	10	5	3	0	10	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	Not evaluated.	

D:\Vivranak\SHREYAS\Folder\Technical Bid evaluation\2nd Phase\Technical Final Evaluation Self.xls

*Done*  
*me*  
*Das*

*qr*

Mid day Meal Scheme  
Bihar Patna

Final Technical Proposals Evaluation Sheet

Sl. No.	Name of CA firm & Address	Empanelled with C&AG and REI (1)	Age of Firm as on 31.03.2024 (2)	Average Annual Turnover three years ending with 31.3.23 (3)	Head office and branch office (4)	Past experience in Similar assignment & Internal audit Statutory Audit (5)	Completed at least 2 but less than 4 internal audit / Statutory Audit assignment of Govt./PSU organization between 21-22 to 23-24.	Completed at least 4 but less than 8 internal audit / Statutory Audit assignment of Govt./PSU organization between 21-22 to 23-24. Assignment will not be Considered.	Maximum Point	Full time partners / CA employee association with the firm (6)	Number of semi qualified staff and article assistant / Audit Staff (7)	Remarks	Reject/ Accept
1													
2													
3													
4													
5													
6													
7													
8													
9													
10													
11													
12													
13													
14													
15													
16													
17													
18													
19													
20													
21													
22													
23													
24													
25													
26													
27													
28													
29													
30													
31													
32													
33													
34													
35													
36													
37													
38													
39													
40													
41													
42													
43													
44													
45													
46													
47													
48													
49													
50													
51													
52													
53													
54													
55													
56													
57													
58													
59													
60													
61													
62													
63													
64													
65													
66													
67													
68													
69													
70													
71													
72													
73													
74													
75													
76													
77													
78													
79													
80													
81													
82													
83													
84													
85													
86													
87													
88													
89													
90													
91													
92													
93													
94													
95													
96													
97													
98													
99													
100													

  
 (Pragati)  
 Nutrition Expert  
 MDM, Bihar Patna

  
 (Md. Muzabeb)  
 A.P.C.  
 MDM, Bihar Patna

  
 (Saroj Kumar)  
 Accounts Officer  
 MDM, Bihar Patna

  
 (Digvijay Kumar)  
 Data Officer cum System Adm.  
 MDM, Bihar Patna

  
 (Baleshwar Prasad Yadav)  
 I/c Deputy Director  
 MDM, Bihar Patna